

MINUTES OF THE 44th EXPANDED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME REFERENCE GROUP MEETING

Thursday, 1st March 2018 – Friday, 2 March 2018
Exhibition Centre, Durban

Chairperson/s: Ignatius Ariyo (NDPW)

Attendance: See « Annexure I »

	DISCUSSION AND DECISIONS	ACTIONS/MATTERS ARISING
A. Welcome and Introduction	<p>Ignatius Ariyo from the National Department of Public Works opened the 44th South African Cities Network (SACN) Reference Group meeting and welcomed all attendees. He introduced himself and the co-chair, Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN), along with the Deputy Director General (DDG) of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), Mr. Stanley Henderson. The Chair requested that the attendees introduce themselves.</p> <p>Her Worship the Mayor, Cllr Zandile Gumede welcomed all attendees on behalf of the city of Ethekewini. She made the following introductory remarks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In light of the National Development Plan (NDP), the city aims to create more jobs through utilising the EPWP programme • The EPWP programme has been instrumental in creating more jobs for the unemployed • Complimented the great work of the DDG and Department of Public Works • Alluded to the impact that expropriation of land without compensation will have on the property, land and agriculture and food security. • Expropriation of land without compensation will speed up the process of dealing with urban development issues. • Encouraged by State of the Province address where progress has been made in terms of economic development. • Over 100 0000 jobs were created within the province over the past year. • Recognises that the EPWP programme since its inception has created over 100 million jobs • Government have a role to play in the implementing successfully EPWP 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The impacts of the programme were highlighted • Ethekwini municipality has created over 16 000 jobs through the EPWP programme during the current financial year. • An additional 36 million budget has been approved in order to create more job opportunities. • Sited that departments are doing well however there are challenges in terms of reporting. • In the next council meeting the municipality hopes to approve their EPWP policy. It is important that the programme be guided by a clearly defined policy. • Policies should guide all that is done within the municipality <p>CLlr Zanele Gumede concluded with the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Officials are finding solutions to challenges of development • Ethekwini aims to be the city that all other cities use as a practical example • If we are all aiming to tackle issues of development everyone has to work together <p>The Chairperson thanked the Mayor of Ethekwini for the warm welcome and then asked all participants to introduce themselves.</p>	
<p>B. Attendance and Apologies, Review and adoption of agenda, and minutes of the previous meeting and matters arising</p>	<p>See Annexure 1 for attendance register. Apologies were received for the following individuals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Simphiwe Dunjana (Buffalo City Municipality). • Andisa Ntwasa (Buffalo City Municipality). • Felile Ngcobo (Ekurhuleni). • Edwell Gumbo (City of Johannesburg). • Patson Khosa (City of Johannesburg). <p>The agenda was adopted with minor changes.</p> <p>The matters arising from the previous meeting were discussed as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation on Integrated Grant review report will be circulated to RG members >>> It was reported that the review report been circulated and that a presentation of the Integrated Grant review will be made during session. It 	

- Postpone intentions to work towards contributing content for the EPWP jobs summit for 2018 >>> State of the nation address indicated that there would a job summit this year. Inputs from EPWP RG are essential as the national department is putting together inputs towards job summit.
- Request city of Ekurhuleni to provide digital copy of presentation on strategies for complying with EIG and AG requirements >>> Deferred to the next meeting
- City of Ethekewini presentation on audit findings to be provided to RG members >>> On the agenda for the session
- Recruitment policy requested >>> The policy will be circulated by the department. Waiting for the Minister of Labour to sign the document. Minister of Labour's co-sign has signed the document and awaiting signature from department and this can be circulated. A draft has been circulated prior to the meeting and the formal signed copy will be circulated in due time. Document is important document that will guide recruitment process given that cities have been having challenges in this regard. E.g City of Tshwane has different system which adopting various methods such as a lottery system.
- Nelson Mandela Bay to provide update on policy review >>> Somikazi Nofilita-Doni stated that the policy has been presented to the mayor and it was recommended that there be engagements with councillors. Thus, workshop was conducted in November. After the workshop was conducted the policy was then sent back to mayoral committee. Currently they are awaiting feedback which will be finalised by June this year. Once passed through council the city will share with EPWP Reference Group (RG) members.
- Follow up on rodent control programme to be documented as a case study >>> To be followed up on by Dr Geci Karuri Sebina, as the case study is either City of Johannesburg or Ekurhuleni.

South African Cities Network (SACN) to circulate documents via email regarding the research approaches for cities to provide inputs >>> Has been circulated.

The chairperson elaborated further by making the RG aware that as part of the annual reporting, the RG has a research agenda. Some of the case studies which are presented in the RG are used in the annual report. RG members who are

The EPWP recruitment policy to be circulated by NDPW once co-signed by the Minister of Labour.

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan Municipality to be shared once approved by council.

SA Cities Network to follow up with City of Johannesburg regarding the rodent control programme.

	<p>new should go onto SACN website (http://www.sacities.net/job-creation), as the annual reports on EPWP can be found there and downloaded. The annual reports have been published since 2009 and they document good case studies from the different cities. This is a way to learn from each other about best practice as well as discuss challenges that cities are facing. EPWP RG is a learning forum where information is shared as well as a platform for the national department to share any new developments. Furthermore,</p> <p>Cities to give inputs on SACN research approaches document>>>Update to be made during presentation</p> <p>SACN to circulate update on communication and engagement platforms when available>>>Presentation was made during the session</p> <p>Public Employment Programme Innovation Programme (PEPIP) update presentation to be circulated to RG members (SACN) >>>Presentation was circulated</p> <p>Presentation on audit findings and challenges for 16/17 financial year>>>Presentation was made by Department of Public Works and was circulated.</p>	
<p>C. Presentation on EPWP 3rd Quarter 2017/18 Progress report and Discussion</p>	<p>A presentation by Mfuneko Kango (Department of Public Works- EPWP) was made on the 3rd Quarter performance of the 2017/2018 financial year.</p> <p>The presentation highlighted the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The objective of the EPWP to be effective and achieve the objectives set out in the NDP-which is to provide opportunities to majority of the urban poor. • The universal principles of phase iii of EPWP, with emphasis on the adherence to the EPWP minimum wage. - minimum wage is sitting at R88 which gets revised on the first of November of each year. • The “Trilemma of EPWP” was one again highlighted where the country is faced with unemployment, and therefore EPWP there to assist in terms of providing development contribution through Social Protection, Employment and Provision of assets and services. • Key documents to be uploaded on EPWP RS System: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ ID Copy (certified) -to be verified as there have been a number of inconsistencies that have been identified. 	

- Copy of workers contracts-it is essential that a copy of workers contracts need to be put in place and contracts need to be signed by the participants and by the employer (needs to be available on site and in the office).
- Attendance Registers-
- Proof of payment
- Overall performance as of 31 December 2017-688 829 work opportunities against 1255 280 (55%) of the annual target achieved. There is one month left in order to achieve the set target.
- Due to the non-achievement of targets the different public bodies need to come up with recovery plans.
- The performance of the metropolitan municipalities have created the following number of work opportunities for quarter 3:
 - Buffalo city municipality-1488 work opportunities
 - City of Cape Town- 10969 work opportunities
 - COJ- 7321 work opportunities
 - City of Tshwane – 9145 work opportunities
 - Ekurhuleni- 4460 work opportunities
 - Ethekwini- 15 569 work opportunities
 - Mangaung- 522 work opportunities
 - Nelson Mandela Bay- 513 work opportunities
 - Msunduzi -2769 work opportunities.
- The overall performance of the metropolitan municipalities shows that cities are under reporting
- It was stated that there is a need for recovery so that projects are reported on and captured
- Good spenders on incentive grants with the exception of Buffalo City and Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality
- The challenges identified in terms of the performance and engagements with cities:
 - Non-reporting of Work Opportunities(WO) created-there are projects that are occurring within cities which are not being reported on.
 - Under reporting on many projects
 - Approved policies -the implementation of approved policies is not being done.
 - Data issues exists, and various data is found in different entities within the municipality and not only in the infrastructure department
- There is a need for cities to engage with the various entities within respective municipalities

- Reporting is important, cities need to be able to monitor data capturers as well as validate the data that is collected.
- Feedback is important to councilors and accounting officers -a substantial number of platforms exist where EPWP can be reported on. Various forums where EPWP can be a standing item.

The chairperson further reiterated that cities are under reporting on EPWP particularly from the metropolitan municipalities. He further stated that metros are critical in terms of meeting the EPWP targets. When metropolitan municipalities under report there is a challenge. The performance review further illustrates that Msunduzi Local Municipality have met their targets and eThekweni was 65%. There is still a lot that cities can do in order to meet their targets. In Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality, there were engagements with the executive team (city manager and executives), and targets were provided for the Executive Directors . Further asked “What is it that cities are going to do to in order to deal with the issues that have been spoken about” given that there is only a month (April 15). The department has observed that on the ground there are more work opportunities than there are being reported. The department was insisting on the supporting documentation, due to the fact that when the AG audits they want to confirm the numbers that have been reported on. There not full sets of documents when it comes to reporting.

Discussions & Comments

Sibusiso Chamane (eThekweni municipality) commented with regards to the performance but particularly on the infrastructure sector. The eThekweni municipality has a challenge with the USDG grant. As a metro the bulk of the funding is on the USDG grant yet when one looks at the list of projects contributing to EPWP, you find there are none from USDG. The municipality has tried to utilize the support from technical support in order for them to engage the implementors on the Urban Settlements Development Grant (USDG) funding. He appealed to Public Works to assist the metros, suggesting that a written communication from National Treasury needs to be sent out to the implementers of USDG grant to compel them to report on EPWP. This can assist in cities improving with their performance.

Somikazi Nofilita-Doni (NMB) commented that while there is an understanding of the minimum wage for EPWP that is implemented. Engagements have been had with national in order to determine the maximum wage. The maximum was indicated to be R350 and documentation to this effect was requested. She asked whether there is a maximum amount for EPWP and where can documentation be found stating this? In addition, there is a challenge of ID copies that get to be disapproved when loaded on the system and when looked at from the office the person can be identified clearly. She wanted to find out whether there is a solution to this issue that the municipality can look at. There are plans for the

The National Department of Public Works (NDPW) needs to engage the Department of Human Settlements on the USDG.

metropolitan municipality to facilitate that when participants are recruited their original ID's are requested. The metropolitan municipality will make copies as well as certify the documents for the participants as a verification tool. On the issue of performance, there is correspondence that the metropolitan municipality has prepared that was submitted to their unit head which will be escalated to the national department with regards to the performance of Nelson Mandela Bay. There are areas which have been identified where performance was informed by the budget only as a result when it came to implementation. Thando Hlongiwa (National Public Works-KZN) added to Sbu Chamane's request with regards to infrastructure sector in Ethekwini, when performance is looked at from the infrastructure perspective only, the performance is not good. The request from Sbu will compel implementors to establish processes that will see reporting happening within the department. Assigning responsibilities in terms of seeing the process and process flow from the ground where information is generated right up until the unit. It needs to be looked at. Being stricter in releasing USDG grant funding as a condition that if reporting is not done / consistent then there will be severe consequences.

Molefe Phillip Ratsiane (City of Tshwane) commented with regards to the confirmation of ID copies, there is a way to do so. When the municipality is requesting IDs, in most cases the city of Tshwane requests the Department of Home Affairs. Information is sent to the Department of Home Affairs and it is requested that they verify the details that are being sent. Home affairs can actually verify the ID numbers. He commented on the presentation which had been made, slide 20 sought to indicate 20million allocated to Tshwane, it surprising because it means that Tshwane has overspend. Just needed clarity on that matter.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) responded that with regards to the USDG grant funding, the Department of Human Settlement will be engaged. USDG funding cannot be withheld as the NDPW is not the transferring office. Engagements with Human settlements will be had to determine how they can monitor USDG closely. By the next meeting a report back will be given to the cities with regards to this matter. He stated that there isn't a maximum wage on EPWP, however, a discussion is being had with regards to this. There is a minimum wage that has been stipulated. The only documentation that has been published is only with regards to the minimum wage. One of the conditions of the minimum wage is that it takes into account the local and skilled labour in the area of jurisdiction. You don't want EPWP wage to be higher than the stipulated wage. The guidelines speak to this context.

In terms of the ID copies, the M&E Chief Directorate will need to be engaged and informed of complaints. A call centre number is available for the M&E Chief Directorate which can be called, or municipalities can email Mfuneko Kango and they will engage with M&E. In some cases when documents are scanned when it reaches the other side the document is sometimes not clear. A copy of an ID copy is not accepted, it must be the first copy that is certified. The system has a link

with home affairs already, so from the side of the department when ID numbers are reported on the system the validation is done.

In terms of the USDG, it is only on aspect of infrastructure, not all infrastructure projects are funded through USDG. There are large numbers of projects that are not being reported on. For the metros, what needs to be done is that different entities or go through department by department e.g JOSCHO in COJ can be able to generate 20 000 jobs alone. We need engage different departments and department will engage with USDG as well, because reporting is critical for performance. In terms of contract documentation, the question needs to be asked is whether contract documentation is aligned to EPWP from the onset and is it aligned to EPWP guidelines. It was suggested that contractors when submitting their payment certificates then they need to submit the EPWP information as well, clauses are there in the EPWP guideline.

Mfuneko Kango (Department of Public Works- EPWP) responded to the comment regarding the spending in the city of Tshwane. There was a budget of twenty million and then the expenditure that came through could be that it was reporting other things as well. It needs to be checked with finance, an appropriate answer will be provided to the city as soon as finance has been engaged.

Stanley Henderson (Department of Public Works- EPWP) commented on the matter regarding the ID copies. He stated that ID copies speak to the data quality issues and the extent to which the AG or any other body the reports are provided to, authenticity of the data, he asked the question of whether it would be incorrect to make the assumption that when, ID copies would be linked to payment systems. What is meant by that is that, where people are employed it is unlikely that they would be paid without a valid ID copy. If paid through a bank through a person bank account it would mean that the bank would have required a valid ID document or valid form of identification in order to open bank account. If ID are linked to financial systems, then that could be a way of validating ID copies.

Molefe Phillip Ratsiane (City of Tshwane) responded that an ID cannot be connected in most cases to the payment. The system can be designed in such a way that if we wanted to verify an ID copy, the only other information especially pertaining to the payment or salary should actually be taken out. The only think the city wants to know is whether one is a south African citizen or not a south African citizen.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) responded that one of the things that need to be looked at is how can the authenticity of participants be verified. It is something that needs thinking through. If participants are paid through the system, then

before they are paid their information on the system needs to be verified. There was information that was obtained. So, if we get a persal report would the Persal report could be verified.. It further stated that due to the collaboration with the Department of Home Affairs , it can be verified whether participant is alive or not.

Somikazi Nofilita-Doni (NMB) commented that the ID verification is two phased. There are those recruitments that are done by EPWP which are done by the municipality themselves and are controlled. There are other work opportunities which are created by service providers, with this one there is a dependency on the service provider to provide the information to the municipality. Most of the time they provide the municipality with the information once they have finished with a project, the challenge then becomes one where the participants are not able to be verified. In terms of a security company whose administration is based in Johannesburg and company is operating in Port Elizabeth.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that in terms of the service providers what is needed are EPWP conditions to be included in the contracts from the onset, due to the fact that the services providers are paid in portions as they undertake their work. He also stated that it was important that a condition be placed that each time they submit claims that they also submit the EPWP information. This would contribute towards mainstreaming. There are clauses in the EPWP Infrastructure guidelines that speak to this. The recruitment strategy of Tshwane is interesting modelled in line with the EPWP recruitment guidelines and is very innovative using data base of potential EPWP participants. It will make the recruitment of participants transparent and make reporting easier since their details would have been captured on database.

Mahlomola Selesa (Mangaung) commented that ID copies can also be verified by municipalities through looking at the ID numbers (e.g the 7th number represents whether an individual is a male or female). The 11th number indicates whether an individual is a South African or not.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that verification can be done through home affairs. According to EPWP policy, foreign nationals canto be recruited within the EPWP programme if they have work permits. However, preference should be given to local South Africans. The biggest challenge being had by the department is that for most public bodies record keeping is poor. Many of the ID copies on site are not certified. Mr. Ariyo stated that certification can be done through any Commission of Oaths.

D. City Updates & Q3 performance review (including special request inserts)

Ethekwini Metropolitan Municipality: Internal Audit and AG compliance

The presentation “Observations, concerns, opportunities for improvement” was made by Ricky Naidoo (senior audit manager) from Ethekwini Municipality was made on the audit plans of the city that are related to EPWP (ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following:

- Objectives of EPWP in terms of poverty alleviation
- The city targeting those who are not able to receive employment
- The EPWP Integrated grant requirements in terms of Ethekwini for the 2017/2018 was R66 792 000 that was allocated to the municipality.
- Audit department undertakes a lot of desktop research in order to determine the required documentation for reporting.
- The audit department works closely with EPWP department to make sure that funded projects and targets are achieved.
- In order to develop the scoping and risk areas of EPWP, the municipality developed what is termed the audit universe. The audit universe aims to understand the total process of EPWP.
- Various policy documents are utilized when undertaking the audit universe in order to make sure processes are compliant.
- Key aspect is that municipalities need to achieve the set targets of EPWP
- How does city report? The units within the municipality are engaged with as well as the heads, deputy heads and Deputy City Managers of the units.
- Cluster reports units engaging with EPWP share items of monthly meetings
- Engagements with auditor general are on an ongoing basis

Discussions & Comments

Stanley Henderson (DPW-EPWP) requested for clarity regarding unfunded EPWP projects, what is meant by that.

Ricky Naidoo (Ethekwini municipality) responded that it means that the city itself funds those projects through own budgets. For eThekwini in the last financial year (16/17), the unfunded projects which the city funded themselves without any grants, were audited in the same principles and the same mandate requirements as funded projects.

Stanley Henderson (DPW-EPWP) further commented that all important individuals from the metropolitan municipalities are present, conceptually there is a need to think along the same lines. He stated that the ideal should be to think around the question of mainstreaming and institutionalizing of EPWP across metropolitan municipalities. In addition, it is important that metropolitan municipalities should not be thinking about unfunded projects and EPWP projects. What is needed is for EPWP approach to be mainstreamed across all departments within the metro as their contribution to the EPWP and the incentive grant then would be that. It would incentivize good behavior and good implementation.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) agreed with Mr. Stanley Henderson and stated that it expected that the cities utilize their own budgets in order to implement EPWP. Whether conditional grants or from the equitable share, that should be utilized for EPWP. EPWP incentive is just a top up/ additional funding that is made available for EPWP. Targets are set based on budgets of the municipality.

Thando Hlongiwa (National Public Works-KZN) requested that the eThekweni municipality extend their audit score to other line departments who are reporting projects on EPWP. So that the outcome of the audit can be discussed at a higher level, then interventions can be made. To further have an overview of how many projects on other grants are reported.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the presentation is an example of good practice that can be shared with other municipalities so that within their internal audit plans they build EPWP within that which can assist in resolving many issues.

Nelson Mhlangu (Mangaung) asked the question of how does internal audit links to the programme without affecting their independence?

Ricky Naidoo (eThekweni municipality) responded that the internal auditors are not linked to EPWP, they independently audit. They provide oversight in operational support at EPWP office in terms of guiding them. Visits are made where the projects are being undertaken. The auditors check compliance.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented if internal audit units work well, they keep the different department on their toes which can strengthen compliance aspects within the cities.

A presentation was made by Sbu Chamane from the Ethekewini municipality regarding the 3rd Quarter performance review (ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following:

Institutional Arrangements

- In terms of the institutional arrangements the current organogram has been approved and being implemented.
- Sbu Chamane has been appointed the deputy head of EPWP.

Policy

- The EPWP policy will be reviewed and approved this year.

Performance

- The quarter three performance review in terms of the work opportunities are:
 - There was a target of 23 484 and actual work opportunities were 15 568
 - In terms of the FTES, the target was 8 208 with actual 4 244
- The fourth quarter performance as of 26 February of 2018 is as follows:
 - With target remaining at 23 484, the actual work opportunities that were created improved to 16 347.
 - In terms of the FTES, the target was 8208 with the actual improvement of 5 837.

Incentive Grant

- The incentive grant utilized has amounted to R66 792 000

Success and Challenges

- Challenges that are faced by the city include: Data collection issues, ID copies of poor quality, under reporting and shortage of data capturers
- EPWP participants are demanding permanent employment.
- Over 500 participants absorbed into permanent positions.

Lessons Learned

- Lessons that have been learned include: institutional arrangements must be in place in order to provide strategic focus and coordination of EPWP
- The proposed way forward includes having weekly Data capturer meetings every Friday in preparation for the City Manager's Weekly Operations Meeting.

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that it is critical that the review of the EPWP policy is concluded. He further stated that the mayor has said the policy would be concluded in June 2018. He stated that he hopes that every head of departments will be having EPWP targets in their scorecards. This will promote the mainstreaming of EPWP. The EPWP Infrastructure Sector is an area of weakness in the municipality that needs to be worked on to get better performance. It is important that contract documentation is aligned to EPWP requirements so that when cities appoint service providers EPWP conditionalities are in the contract document already.

City of Tshwane: EPWP Recruitment Strategy

A presentation was made by Tich Meckhoe, Nelson Mhlangu, Phillip Ratsiane from the city of Tshwane regarding the 3rd Quarter performance review (ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following:

- Found that audit discussion necessary as the city of Tshwane is taking the same approach as the city of eThekweni. Audit plays a crucial role especially when it comes to the recruitment process.
- The city is certain that by June targets will be met although there are various challenges
- The city took the decision to reconfigure the organizational structure. 14 portfolios include: social development (homelessness, ECDs and Indigents), sports and recreation, arts and culture (libraries and heritage), military veterans, youth etc.
- Vision was needed to include all portfolios
- Different departments play different roles within EPWP in the city: Social Development is currently the lead department, human capital/HR who recruit the participants etc.
- Decision to expand on structure where EPWP regional coordinators will be appointed by the city. In addition, supervisors will be appointed who supported by steering committee where there is going to be champions in each department.
- The division of EPWP does not have an executive director
- The city is under staffed where there are only two directors-programme management position is currently vacant.
- The City is relying on National Department of Public works to supply the city with data capturers
- A centralized email address has been created where when a department requires participants can request them through one central email.

City of Tshwane to provide recruitment strategy documents as well as other documents to RG members

- Participants are requested to register per ward if a project is in a particular ward then those participants within those wards will be selected.
- If there are no participants in a particular, then a neighboring ward will be referred to.
- A lottery system is utilized to select the participants.
- Chief Audit verifies the details of participants after they have been selected
- The process of establishing a panel of trainers for three years which will look at induction and training. There is a capacity is in shortage
- The Regional Executive directors play a role in ensuring that all the documents are submitted
- Proof is needed to show that participants are working. There is a system that is put in place to prevent participants from being paid without working (register and time sheets are referred to)
- The City of Tshwane is currently busy with consultations with departments and regions done on a quarterly basis to ensure they know about EPWP
- The main goal for the city is to meet the targets.
- 123 000 people who have applied to be on the EPWP database.
- The target for this financial year was 23 000.
- The distribution of targets will be done per department in the new financial year.
- Infrastructure sector the issue is around the supply chain processes

Molefe Ratsiane presented on the Recruitment Strategy of the presentation as follows:

- The EPWP recruitment guideline was approved on the 20th of September 2017
- The Mayor embarked on a roadshow throughout the 7 regions to roll out the new recruitment process.
- The recruitment guideline came about due to challenges of nepotism through the recruitment of participants
- In order to be registered on the system there are various documents which are required to be verified (proof of residence, cv, ID)
- Criteria to be registered is that you need to be unemployed, South African citizen, reside within COT, 18 years and older
- There are 120 683 applications which have been received for potential EPWP participation.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) stated that method of recruitment in City of Tshwane shows that there is innovation and new ways of doing things within EPWP.

Discussions

Stanley Henderson (DPW-EPWP) commented that it is clear that the biggest challenge for under performance of cities lies in the infrastructure sector. South African citizens only to be employed, members need to be aware of the constitutional challenges that could arise. A work permit allows foreign nationals to entitled to anything that a south African citizen is entitled to. In terms of working age, the official working age is 16 years. He further asked whether projects are planned per every ward and are they addressing the apartheid spatial planning and the inequalities that come with that? Does COT have a link with work seekers database from the department of labour.

Thando Wababa (DPW)-welcomed the presentation that was made by City Of Tshwane (COT). He further raised a question of how exhaustive the database is given that there are over 123 000 participants and how frequently is it going to be updated as only those who are in the database are considered as participants.

Thando Hlongiwa (National Public Works-KZN) sought point of clarity of which targets would be met by June 2018.

Tich Meckhoe (COT) responded that the comments were helpful, and the gaps would be looked into within the recruitment guide. In terms of the issue of projects, the city has a plan that deals with spatial development to bridge the development gaps. The IDP is clear around which projects are to be undertaken within the municipality. Sometimes projects fall within the boundaries of two wards and that is where both wards get an opportunity to contribute in the infrastructure development.

There are a lot of work stoppages where projects are hijacked, they are hijacked by a group of community members. Where they will say to contractors that they want 70% of the work. The reasons for not reaching targets is work stoppages and supply chain processes. The bulk of the problem is work stoppages. Some of interventions that have been adopted to deal with the issue is the fact that the city has appointed CLOs.

In terms of the database he commented that there are 123 000 registered individuals because when the recruitment drive was done, there were some individuals who were not certain of how the programme works. They thought it was about infrastructure projects. The next phase is that the lottery will be done in the community so that the database is updated. They will make sure that politicians will not be involved in these processes

Stanley Hederson (DPW-EPWP) asked what the unemployment rate in the city of Tshwane is?

Tich Meckhoe (COT) responded that not certain what the rate is however on the youth side the unemployment is around 23%.

Nelson Mhlangu (COT) commented on the matter concerning the Department of Labour, when busy establishment of recruitment centre database, the city was engaging with Department of Labour. The targets that were spoken off refer to the 6000 is the 6000 that only started in December 2017 up until February 2018. The target that was being referred to in the presentations is the city and national target.

Phillip Ratsiane (COT) made a concluding remark, the age of workers, The EPWP policy states that persons 18years and older should be employed. The target for this financial year is 23 000 that should be employed by the end of June.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) stated that the RG members should be aware that the national target must be met by end of March. There is a recognition that there is also a municipal target.

Nelson Mandela Bay: Policy Review

A presentation was made by Somikazi Nofilita-Doni (NMB) from Nelson Mandela Bay municipality regarding the 3rd Quarter performance review (ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following:

- In terms of the institutional arrangements EPWP in the municipality has undergone changes and has been downgraded from a unit to a sub-unit due to performance from previous years.
- One of the key things to improve performance is that EPWP is reporting under EDTA
- There was no head in the EPWP unit since November 2018 and now Somikazi Nofilita-Doni was appointed as the coordinator.
- In terms of policy, the EPWP policy was presented the councilors to get by in from them.
- The policy will be approved before the end of the financial year.

- In terms of performance, the municipality is just 21% to their targets.
- The key challenges is that targets are set strictly on budget without considering if those particular project identified would yield work opportunities.
- The municipality is not going to achieve their set EPWP targets on work opportunities. A written communication will be sent to the Department with regards to the performance.
- Incentive grant performance is at 49%, the question raised is whether the municipality would be able to spend the money before the end of the financial year.
- Midterm review expenditure has been done in February, there is a recognition that there is a challenge however areas where money could be spent on will be identified through various projects by end of May.
- Projects involved on IG, one is tourism and culture project. 25 beach patrol ambassadors were employed beach patrol, safe guarding providing comfort to tourists. Ambassadors working with metro police, beach cleaning in order to maintain the blue flag status in the municipality.
- Another project that was mentioned was environment and cleaning. Settlers park is one of the tourist attractions aim at removing and cleaning alien vegetation and ensuring compliance to environmental requirements.
- In terms of successes, the political buy in has improved.
- Challenges is the strict approach to setting targets, limited number of projects that are labour intensive
- Recommendation is to revise the protocol agreement.

Discussion

Mfuneko Kango (Department of Public Works- EPWP) asked the question of what it means for the EPWP unit to be downgraded to a sub unit; what does it say in terms of the municipality policy?

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that in terms of getting by in from councilors. A presentation was had with the mayor of NMB, the feedback was positive however that has not translated. According to municipal survey resolutions, EPWP is supposed to be led by senior officials in municipalities. The department welcomes engagement with NMB in order to support the municipality in improving performance. Concerning are the downgrading of targets, as EPWP is meant to be creating more jobs because of slow economic growth. Target of 6 million was set assuming economic growth was 3%. When targets, budgets were looked at and the department took a conservative view, the whole budget was not considered, percentages were considered (e.g. 20% of MIG, 35% USDG etc.). In NMB in particular, when presentation was

made to the H.O.Ds , they were resistant on the budget. There is a need to look at what the issues are and further look at the new revised policy to see whether it works for the city or not.

Mangaung

Lethokuhle Mathebula (Mangaung) provided and update 3rd Quarter performance review.

The following was highlighted:

- A presentation for the executive mayor was prepared in order to inform mayor of EPWP. Mayor was briefed through provincial department of Public Works. The unit intends to have a briefing session also with councilors.
- The key challenges to EPWP in the municipality is underreporting. The city does not have data capturers, all data capturing is done through the provincial department.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) asked the question of what the institutional arrangements are currently in Mangaung. And Where is EPWP coordinated and whether there is a unit or not. In addition, who the responsible person under EPWP in Manguang. There have been problems in finding the contact person for EPWP in Mangaung. A policy was approved in line with phase three, the question is whether they are aware of the policy. For the fourth quarter currently, which projects could be provided in terms of data.

Lethokuhle Mathebula (Mangaung) responded that EPWP is currently being coordinated directly from the office of the executive mayor, the post for the position of manager of EPWP is still vacant. Currently Lethokuhle Mathebula and Mahlomola Seleso are the individuals to contact regarding EPWP. In terms of the policy, it was approved by previous council in power. In terms of data that can now be provided for the current quarter, still needs to be collected from the various departments which will form part of the reporting requirements that will be sent through to the department.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that they will provide the municipality of Mangaung with the EPWP policy, where the city can work from. The policy can be utilized to engage various departments on. He further suggested that the municipality link with Mfuneko Kango (Department of Public Works- EPWP), who will link with colleague in Mangaung who is supporting the province.

Lethokuhle Mathebula (Mangaung) requested the implementation protocol

DPW-EPWP to provide Manguang with EPWP policy

Mahlomola Seleso added that, the following week the executive mayor will meet with the contractors, so that projects are reported on throughout the city as part of the intervention.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that there is a need to meet with the technical department in Mangaung so that documents are converted to be aligned to EPWP. When contracts are put out then it speaks to the policy.

Msunduzi

A presentation was made by Skhumbuzo Ndawande from Msunduzi municipality regarding the 3rd Quarter performance review (ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following points:

Institutional arrangements

- There is an addition of 2 data capturers since the beginning of February 2018
- Take advantage in terms of reporting

Policy

- The policy was approved on the 25 September 2013
- Further amendments made to include phase three targets

Quarter 3 performance review

- Improvements have been made with regards to performance in the context of work opportunities and FTES than the previous quarter
- Target of 2285 and actual 1482 (64%)
- Per sector infrastructure target 1996 and actual 563 (28%)
- Environmental and culture sector target 289 and actual 902
- Did not receive targets for Social sector

Incentive Grant Performance

- Allocation is R8 022 000,00
- Grant received in total R5 615 000,00

Project overview

DPW-EPWP to provide Manguang with signed protocol and approved EPWP policy.

- Flagship projects: city clean up with 200 beneficiaries (92 woman and 102 youth)
- Total budget for the project is R4 456 000
- Another project is the Ward Based which is a maintenance programme
- 780 work opportunities have been created in the context of the project
- Total budget for the project is R13 478 400
- Another project is the construction of the sidewalks
- Project began in September 2017
- Project involved constructing an 800m concrete sidewalk and curbing
- 24 working opportunities was created
- Total budget for the project is R2 822 505

Successes and Challenges

- Part of the outputs from the programme, was the learnership programme that was given to the management of EPWP
- A total of 97 127 km of streets have been swept in the last quarter
- Successes on approved EPWP Projects have been implemented for 12 months in the current financial year 2017/18
- Identified three projects that commenced late had impacts in terms of the work opportunities and Full Time Equivalent (FTEs). With assistance from the technical team the projects have been fast tracked.
- Dropping out of beneficiaries without notifying the management

Lessons learned

- Induction of municipal officials on EPWP assisted in ensuring efficient implementation, reporting and monitoring
- EPWP Practitioners to be trained on the EPWP Programme so that everyone is on the same page when it comes to EPWP.

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that Msunduzi Local Municipality has done well in terms of targets however more can be done. In terms of meetings had with the municipality, there various departments who are not reporting fully, the infrastructure department is one of them. There are a lot of projects, for example there was a Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) project that was being constructed however it was not reported on. There is a need to mainstream EPWP in the infrastructure department. He questioned whether contract documents have been aligned to EPWP. One of the weakness

	<p>identified in Msunduzi Local Municipality is that there is no EPWP steering committee. The approved EPWP policy has to be implemented. Not only is there a need for induction of officials but for also councillors.</p> <p>he Department is willing to support the municipality in training, or doing a workshop in order to make officials, managers, councillors of EPWP. Msunduzi should liaise with the National Department of Public Works to find dates for an EPWP induction workshop with officials and councillors.</p>	<p>Msunduzi Local Municipality to get in touch with the National Department of Public Works to identify possible dates for an EPWP induction workshop.</p>
<p>E. Public Employment Programme Innovation Programme (PEPIP) update</p>	<p>Kate Phillips from the Government Technical Advisory Centre (GTAC) made a presentation which provided an update on the Public Employment Programme Innovation Partnership (PEPIP). (ppt)</p> <p>The presentation indicated the following regarding the initiative:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public Employment Programme Innovation Partnership (PEPIP) is a partnership between Cities Support Programme, South African Cities Network, EPWP, The Economies Region Learning Network which brought together practitioners in regional and economic development from across South Africa and GTAC. • Purpose is to support innovation in public employment in the city. • The aim of the partnership is to provide technical assistance in supporting innovation to enhance impacts across various sectors. This is done with cities who request assistance in this regard. It is important to understand that it does not involve funding but technical support to unblock blockages that may hinder the possibility of innovation. 	

- Innovation was defined as ‘doing things better and doing things differently’. The emphasis is on doing things better in the context of a given city.

Ethekwini case study

- In terms of progress, Ethekwini was the first city to request assistance.
- There has been critical success factor in Ethekwini because there has been a strong by at senior level.
- In working with the eThekwini municipality there has been a recognition of the interface between informal settlement upgrading and public employment.
- Looking for opportunities to explore how to develop integrated approaches to informal settlement upgrading.
- Have funding from an EU programme focused on building participatory community development approaches to informal settlement upgrading.
- Ethekwini Metropolitan Municipality wanted to revisit prior research on Zibambele model and how model can be adapted further and to explore partnerships with private sector
- Most progress has happened in relation to initiating the informal settlement upgrading processes envisaged.
- Agreement to use a public employment approach to undertaking social and economic surveys in selected informal settlements using local youth. Adapting an approach that was developed in Gauteng in partnership with the university of Johannesburg.
- City wants to look at not only public employment in informal settlements but as part of the informal settlement upgrading process.
- Pending issues are funding modality-the process needs to be mainstreamed into the existing system within the municipality.
- How to get the money into the system in such a way that process is tied to EPWP
- Question of how to fund it? Should it be funded through incentive grant or should it come from core budgets of Ethekwini?
- World Bank has also come to the fore in terms of offering funding for some of the data analysis.
- The key question is how is this kind of innovation mainstreamed and integrated into EPWP in an effective way

Buffalo City Municipality case study

- Turned into a priority project this financial year to spend the incentive grant before year end.
- The city is underspending on the Incentive Grant
- Project has been signed off by the manager

- Look at the Early Childhood Development (ECD) programme in targeted townships and informal settlements, utilizing similar methodology to the eThekweni municipality.
- Project is funded by a donor with the purpose of a piloting approach with the hope of it being integrated into EPWP.
- The woman and girl pilot project in Duncan Village, which has involved engagements with young woman in the community to develop strategies to enhance safety.

Other metros updates

- In Cape town the project has stalled
- In Johannesburg, presentation was made to the EPWP steering committee and follow up is anticipated.
- It was announced that the door is open for other metropolitan municipalities.

Discussions

Mandla Zuma (Msunduzi Municipality) commented that the PEPiP programme together with EPWP has been overtaken by events. In addition, the presentation begins to make cities about how to think about other possible funding options for projects linked to EPWP. He was fascinated by the survey methodology, to say whether it would be possible to set up a project utilizing surveys and how does one deal with the unemployed graduates.

Maximus Vogt (GIZ) asked the question of what other plans there are for documenting the processes that have been mentioned in the presentation, which have been done with a couple of the cities.

Kate Phillips (GTAC) responded that the expectation is that the case studies will be written up, through the City Support Programme, because it is a partnership, they have a platform. SACN also has a platform and she hopes that the case studies can be placed in the EPWP annual report. CSP also deals with senior managers across the metros.

Maximus Vogt (GIZ) followed up with another question and asked who was involved in the woman and girl's safety project in BCM.

Kate Phillips (GTAC) responded that Harambee is involved with the implementation

	<p>Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) concluded that what needs to be taken from this, is that cities can request the assistance, it seems that Msunduzi might be interested. The programme is open to cities who require technical support in areas of innovation.</p> <p>Kate Phillips (GTAC) responded that one of the lessons from the case studies is that they are not quick processes. It is process intensive because innovation requires a lot of consultation and engagement. The idea was that the programme would end in June, CSP has decided to extend the programme.</p>	
<p>F. Presentation on Integrated Grant Review report</p>	<p>Kate Phillips (GTAC) made a presentation which provided an update on the Integrated Grant Review report (ppt).</p> <p>The presentation highlighted the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incentive review was undertaken for DPW in 2017 • Draft was presented in April 2017 and the final data for 2016/2017 was not out at the time. It should be noted that the data is dated. • It was a review of all the incentive grants including the provincial incentive grant, the municipal incentive grant, environmental culture and social grant. • Many positive outcomes of the incentive grant <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mainstreamed participation in public employment widely across government ○ Increase in the diversity of projects. ○ Big shifts in labour intensity. ○ Evidence of innovation, commitment and delivery. • There are issues to address and improve <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Issues with focus groups: focus groups were held with provinces, district municipalities and municipalities and metros ○ The main concerns were as follows: a concern that good performance doesn't translate necessarily into increased allocations. ○ Lack of clarity on how allocation formulae actually works 	

- Difficulties in getting departments to understand the grant as an incentive for reporting against their core budgets (constantly seen as standalone or top up funding).
- For some departments or public bodies, the amounts for the grant in some instances pretty small which leads to stop start projects.
- There is excessive focus on reporting quantitative matrix vs impacts and compliance
- Cross cutting issues within the context of the provincial and municipal grant:
 - Key issue that came out strongly was the issue around the formulae that is used to determine the allocation of the grant.
 - If you not understanding the basis that one is being measured on in relation to the incentive grant it undermines the incentive effect.
 - Another issue is the issue of the targets. The targets are set using a ratio that assumes 6.7 FTE's per million in grant allocations. Which results in a labour intensity of 13% which is very low.
 - The proliferation of small projects
 - Minimal allocations-if there is reporting there is minimal allocations. Every provincial department reporting to EPWP gets a minimum of R2 m p/a - Even if they don't reach the minimum threshold required to 'earn' this R2m
- It's important that the impact is not just about the numbers, it's also about the quality of the work, assets and services that are being delivered to the community.
- Municipalities are exceeding their targets when it comes to the Incentive grant in contrast to the overall EPWP where there is underperformance.
- FTEs in 2014/2015 financial year were higher than the targets however two years later are lower than what was achieved in 2014/2015
- Vast majority of target needs to come from MIG but in practice not happening
- For the MIG is small proportion of total budgets
- There is underspending on infrastructure budgets
- What happens in practice is that in terms of allocation most municipal and provincial government are not allocating so much to infrastructure but to other sectors.
- Ethekwini approach to the incentive grant has lessons
 - The city makes a substantial contribution to EPWP from its core budgets; the IG adds approximately 10% to this

Recommendations

- Engaging National Treasury on issues of allocations not linked to aggregate improvements and performance
- Need to simplify formulae on the EPWP Integrated Grant.
- Need to phase out minimum allocations as they were used to attract public bodies into EPWP and now it seems cross subsidizing non-performance
- Need for five-year qualitative impact evaluation plan
- There is continued frustration with reporting system by users
- Phase out minimum allocations after a once-off incentive
- Raise minimum threshold
- Incentive grant is not the best mechanism to scale up and replicate the rural roads maintenance programmes

Recommendations for step change

Incentive appearing not to be the right instrument therefore there is a need to look at other mechanisms

- GTAC challenged by DPW to think through further about a step change approach and thin differently about the incentive grant in order to achieve better impacts
- Presentation evokes a discussion
- There is a need to revisit assumptions
- Move towards a programmatic approach
- Change in practice that creates more jobs
- Some of the proposals according to the presentation include:
 - Ringfencing the Incentive grant for the metros due to the fact that metros are working better than other municipalities
 - Consolidate elements of existing grant and use that to create PEP conditional grant fund that pre-approves projects
 - Support longer term, larger scale, higher impact, more cost-effective multi-year approaches
 - Challenge fund approach
- Open debate about whether the current incentive grant is optimal for achieving the kinds of impacts that are sought
- If PEP Conditional Grant was to be funded, it would be important to augment such a fund
- Recommendations are not firm and should be taken as debate seeking.

Discussion

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) stated that there were two parts to the presentation, the first part is the recommendation using the current approach and the second part focusses on a step change which requires looking at the incentive grant differently.

Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN) commented that the presentation was very stimulating. She first asked a process question whether: there are recommendations which are being mentioned in the report and what would be the impact on of the report on future phases of EPWP. She added that the recommendations on step change would require political support to implement. Dr. Geci Karuri-Sebina also observed that there was not much focus on labour-intensity aspects in the presentation and wondered if this represented a philosophical change in thinking around what EPWP is built.

Kate Phillip (GTAC) responded that she spoke lot about labour intensity included in the step change. Furthermore, there is a need to add complementary approaches to dealing with the issue. She further added that the EPWP Incentive not having the desired incentive effect on either reporting or labour intensity in terms of municipalities although there has general improvement in Labour-intensity. . Labour intensity issue and infrastructure remain important, but the question is then whether the correct levers are being utilised in order to achieve what needs to be achieved through the incentive grant. Dr. Kate Phillip indicated that she agrees that with the dangers of the institutional change is very high hence the recommendations focus on the incremental improvements to what exists.

She indicated that the step change discussion is about having an open-minded discussion. The important part around introducing a challenge fund element where programmes are supported is that one can look at along with incremental changes without change the current structure of the system. Hence there is emphasis on the need for additional sources of funding. **Thando Wababa (DPW)** commented that he agrees on many of the areas that that Dr. Kate Phillip has presented on. Mr. Thando Wababa questioned whether the approach ought not to be the EPWP grant instead of the incentive grant. He further questions whether there is a need to be all encompassing or there should there be a focus in terms of funding of the EPWP Integrated Grant.

Dr. Kate Phillip (GTAC) responded that it's good that the discussions were being had. Dr. Kate Phillip stated it was agreed that there was a better understanding of where the impacts of the EPWP Integrated Grant are. She stated that Zibambele is good programme that can be used of one the case studies to be used . Thinking about complimentary modalities where we know there are greater impacts.

Ricky Naidoo (eThekweni municipality) commented that the presentation was very informative. The funding that was mentioned, the incentive grant releases a portion of funding from core budget. It can be used across EPWP sectors. In terms of the 13% labour intensity, the labour intensity varies from project to project. If some of the projects in eThekweni are looked at such as Zibambele is very high intensity labour and capital involved. Another case study around labour

	<p>intensity is a project called GO Durban which was more capital intensive than labour intensive. There is broad mix of projects.</p> <p>Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the presentation on the review of the EPWP Integrated Grant was balanced and nuanced. It focused on the positives and looks at areas where improvement is required. With regards to processes, there have been changes that have already been implemented from the presented work. An example where there has been implementation is in terms of the threshold for FTEs for this financial year have already used a higher threshold.</p> <p>In terms of the process there is a need for discussions around the step change. There is a need to decide what can be done in the short term or the long term. Issues like step change and the challenge fund need broad consultation and discussion. Incremental implementation of the review of the EPWP Integrated Grant need to be considered.</p>	
<p>G. Presentation on Urban Safety-EPWP</p>	<p>A presentation was made by Max Vogt from GIZ on Urban Safety and its link to EPWP (ppt).</p> <p>The presentation highlighted the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Violence and Prevention programme funded by the German Development Agency (GIZ) has been in existence since 2012 • The aim of the programme is to strengthen violence prevention approaches on the local level through supporting not only municipality but also supporting national and provincial government in their support to local level. • Work across three areas of intervention: Closing the implementation gap, active youth for safer communities and Collaborative thinking and action. • The GIZ support in collaboration with the Department of Public Works around EPWP programme and integrating violence prevention within the programme. • The GIZ was involved with the Community Work Programme (CWP) programme working on institutionalisation of violence prevention within the CPW programme. • The Learnings came out of the process and also challenges which led to a partnership with DPW. • The GIZ together with DPW have commentioned a study into the impact of what the EPWP does for violence prevention in communities. • There is a lot been done around safety and programmes are targeted at community safety. • The study would look at the broader understanding of violence prevention and safety. The study would also document good practices. 	

- The study would inform policy recommendations for DPW. The report from the study will service as a guide for municipalities that want to implement violence prevention programme.

Discussion

Bongumusa Zondo (acting head Safer Cities in eThekweni) commented that they would be meeting Max Vogt from GIZ in the following week. It is important to look at public spaces not only from the design perspective but how a designer allows for activation and expropriation of public spaces. . In documenting best practices knowledge management is key to indicate the learning lessons from the beginning.

Mandla Zuma (Msunduzi) commented that there are other sectors (environmental, social who can play a critical role when it comes to issues around the Violence Prevention Programme. It is important that there was liaison with Community Safety and Liaison departments.

Max Vogt (GIZ) responded that the same comment came from the previous meeting. Community safety and liaison departments vary across cities and provinces on their effectiveness .. In the project on COJ, there is a multi-stakeholder approach to community safety. The community safety department of Gauteng is involved and the community safety unit of City of Johannesburg.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that one of the take always from the presentation is that having engagements are being held with cities on the Violence Prevention Programme. He wanted to know how the programme is linking to the Non-tate sector of EPWP, is there any link with the NPO programme and how far are the discussions?

Max Vogt (GIZ) responded that the study will look into the Non-State sector as that's is one of the clear objectives of the study. To further look at what are the pillars of the EPWP programme and what is happening already. Study will look at how to better link up what is happening in the Non-State sector and in the other parts of the EPWP programme.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) asked Max Vogt when would the study be completed.?

Max Vogt (GIZ) responded that the timeline at the moment is that the study should be complete by the end of May 2018, depending on GIZs procurement processes.

	<p>Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) responded that it would be advisable at the next meeting to have a presentation on the results of the study. Furthermore, he added that it is important e that projects are documented from day one because there are a lot of lessons to be learnt. EPWP units need to know what GIZ is doing because some of the incentive grants could be used to fund community safety programmes.</p> <p>Max Vogt (GIZ) commented that the project for city of Johannesburg stemmed from the idea of these community park activators. The idea came from the city safety programme and Johannesburg city parks, it was through the EPWP unit facilitated by the GIZ programme that EPWP unit saw a benefit to their programme. The EPWP unit decided that they would utilise incentive grant in order to create job opportunities through safety initiatives.</p> <p>Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) stated that there is a similar project in Nelson Mandela Bay, where there is community safety and it is funded the project through incentive grant.</p>	
<p>H. EPWP-RG Support Work:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2017/2018 Research/ work programme • Update on communication and engagement platforms/ opportunities 	<p>A presentation was made by Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina and Sadhna Bhana from South African Cities Network regarding an update on the EPWP-RG Support work as well as an update on the communication and engagement platforms (ppt).</p> <p>The presentation highlighted the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Reference group is able to be convened on the basis of the relationship between the DPW and SACN’s through a funding. The MOU has been signed with SACN and NDWP which allows funding and enables the support needed for the next five years. • What the MOU covers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Quarterly Reference Group meetings. ○ Annual reporting. ○ Collaborative/Supportive Research ○ Technical Support. • The hosting of the Reference group meetings are rotating across the cities. The dates change. • Quarterly meetings are about sharing and learning. • The EPWP Reference Group annual reports that have been produced. The reports are available electronically on the SACN website 	<p>Research agenda for the 2018/19 financial</p>

- The EPWP Reference Group annual report has mostly focused on describing performance and there is a need to improve on the analytical aspects.
- The last EPWP Reference meeting prioritized what the research agenda should be for the next period. Comments were not received from the Cities on the research topics that were sent out.
- The research agenda was about the urban safety link, it was about leveraging some of the existing opportunities with partners for research (working with Treasury looking to optimise across grants towards employment).
- Proposition on how to approach the contracting in of the research and how it fits into the next report.
- As first part of the report to have usual metrics, statics and diagnostics that is usually presented and to try improving the analytics.
- The second part focuses on institutional issues. Institutional arrangements are always reported on. However, there is a lack of focus on broader strategic and policy issues and therefore there is need to improve on that aspect.. The issue of systems and reporting normally brought in as a problem; suggestion to do something that looks deeper at this issue.
- One of the ideas being considered is to commission a set of studies that look at economic trends in the context of public employment programmes with a view to leveraging on municipal finance to boost employment.

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) suggested that the RG begin working on the papers. Positioning ourselves for the job summit. He stated that there needs to be positive elements as what contributions Public Employment Programmes (PEPs) make to employment in the urban context. It is important to position PEPs in order to context the evidence over a number of years. He found it interesting that some cities such as city of Cape Town are utilising SACN's report in their presentations. Positive thing to contribute to the body of knowledge. In addition, the analysis of performance should continue to be enhanced within the report.

Thando Wababa (DPW) stated that he is in agreement with what has been said. In terms of the research are of leveraging public finance, the current body of knowledge is limited..He stated that if the current research topic on finance for PEPs is kept. It should be renamed into Leveraging Finances to boost employment which links to the work of GTAC and other sources of finance.

Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN) responded that it would an interesting element. The challenge is that it will force the paper to engage with the Inter- Governmental Relation (IGR) issues, which is funding that municipalities are not in control of.

to be finalised by SACN.

Sadhna Bhana (SACN) provided an update on communication and engagement platforms. She stated there has been a promise to provide an update regarding a communication platform to share documents, presentations etc that comes out of the RG meetings. The cloud system formerly used was not effective. The new system enables access to other reference group materials. The system is still being developed however it is close to completion.

- The objective of the new communication platform was to enhance learning for SACN members and SACN employees. The new communication system capabilities of the system include:
 - Sharing of document repository
 - Sharing across reference groups
 - Data sharing
 - Live chats
 - Multi-media sources
- The system requires that members register on the platform and fill out a profile. There are various kinds of users on the platform: basic user, participant user and Super user
- EPWP was used as an example where members will be able to have access to documents, and dates of next meetings, publications and multi media
- The way forward is that the extranet is expected to be completed at the end of March 2018
 - Testing for RG group to be done in April 2018
 - Uploading of all info to be completed in July 2018

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the extranet is encouraging especially on the interactive forum in order to learn from other reference groups. It's a working progress and he stated that he hopes the system will be up and running at the next reference group meeting. He posed the question of whether the cloud is still active in order to access information.

Sadhna Bhana (SACN) commented that the cloud is still active until such time the extranet is fully completed.

Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN) stated that for those who do not have access to the cloud and have not been offering it. Contact Sadhna should one not have access to the cloud. Individual emails should be sent to Sadhna

Communication platform for EPWP RG to be finalised by SACN.

<p>I. Way forward and Closure, confirmation of next meeting</p>	<p>Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) stated that in terms of hosting for the next meeting, whether Mangaung would be able to do so.</p> <p>Lethokuhle Mathebula (Mangaung) responded that the city would be open to engagements as they might not be able to make a decision right there and then.</p> <p>Within the next three months Nelson Mandela could possibly host subject to approval. It was agreed that the next meeting will be in July and venues will be looked at.</p> <p>The proceedings of the day on the 1st of March 2018 were closed at 4.15pm.</p>	<p>Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality to host the next South African Cities Network meeting.</p>

Friday, 2 March 2018

Site visit: Priority Zone: Rooftop Garden

The case study project which the RG members were taken through was the Priority Zone: Rooftop Garden in the Durban inner city on Monty Naicker Road. Thobile Ngcobo from the Ethekewini Municipality provided insights about the project and how it came about.



The following points were made on the site:

- The Rooftop Garden was initiated in 2010 and has been up and running for over seven years.
- The rooftop garden has been up and running for over 7 years
- The building is a one storey Green Building that has been transformed from an unused space into a lush garden that contains a variety of indigenous plants, vegetables and herbs and a well-used recreational space
- There was no budget for the project hence various items that are recyclable, and reusable were collected
- Through the project they have been able to create employment through the EPWP programme
- Three people maintain the garden

Exhibition : Case study examples in eThekweni

Area-based management/precinct management

A presentation was made by **Linda Mbonambi** from eThekweni municipality regarding an overview of the area based management/precinct plan and how eThekweni municipality utilises EPWP as a means to job creation in the city (pdf).

The presentation highlighted the following points:

- Area Based Management (ABM) is a learning programme in the context of thinking about how things can be done better and innovatively in the city of eThekweni.
- Areas of strength in the programme is the use and application of different methodologies of learning
- Methodology encourages peer to peer learning
- Partnership with Connected Cities based in Germany
- First ten years of the programme was a pilot with EU
- Have recently embraced the Smarty City Framework
- As smart city there is a view that how one governs the city, how it protects natural environment and the economy should be imbedded in terms of how we use technology as an enabler.
- Smart city goes beyond technology and also about management systems, policies advocated for do in terms of enabling for example job creation. The focus is on people and communities.
- Recognition that attention needs to be placed to the basics of service delivery before advocating to be the best city in the world
- Promoting urban spaces that work
- Various models are being utilised and ideas for what plans there are in the arena of job creation
- Number of issues the city is dealing with but newer issues the city has found interest in, is dealing with unmanaged activities of informal recyclers.
- City has been divided into a number of precincts
 - Metro significance
 - Local Significance, Sub-Urbs and Townships
 - Regional Significance

- Informal Settlements and Rural Settlements
- EPWP important value add in terms of cleaning up of the city
- Ensuring that the purpose of local government in the facilitation and management and coordination, imbeds job creation as an important pillar.
- Key focus when the city coordinates is the support of activities that are run by businesses and citizens

The Inner-City Precinct Plan

A presentation was made by Thobile Ngcobo from eThekweni municipality regarding an overview of the Inner-City precinct plan and how eThekweni municipality utilises EPWP as a means to job creation in the city (pdf).

The presentation highlighted the following points:

- Prior to rooftop garden being established a mind mapping exercise was done to monitor and report the work being done by line management according to service level agreements
- The Precinct Management function is not to replace the Line Department Function or Responsibility
- In terms of the institutional settings, there was the implementation of “clean and Safe” precincts
- The approach is that issues are constantly being monitored on the ground before a complaint is lodged
- Plan assisted in terms of revitalising the city:
 - Cleaner environment
 - Safer environment
 - Improved trading environment
- In order to transfer the approach, it is important that service level agreements are in place, identify the cross-cutting issues, engage relevant stakeholders and urban management forums

Urban Renewable: Case Study of the Silverglen Nature Reserve

A presentation was made by **Eurakha Singh** from eThekweni municipality regarding the Silverglen Nature Reserve Revitalization Project (pdf).

The presentation highlighted the following points:

- Area Based Management is involved in coordinating and facilitating work in a defined area
- South Durban Basin is the largest industrial installation
- Managing relationship between industry and the people

- Case study is located in Chatsworth which 14km from the city centre
- The nature reserve in 2013 had lost its greenery and was known to be an area where there were violent crimes
- The project was initiated due to complaints from residence about the area
- CPF started policing the area
- August 2017 the park was secured, and the community approached ABM to assist in fixing the park
- An Integrated approach was adopted, and stakeholders engaged
- Meetings were held, and action plans identified
- What was achieved?
 - Recreational zone was reinstated
 - Road refurbished
- Environmental issues were identified, and environmental plan is being devised
- Lessons learnt from the project is:
 - Integrated approach is key
 - Address low hanging fruit
 - Use local labour to address issue of alien vegetation
 - To see what job opportunities can come out of projects.
 - Environmental awareness.

Urban Regeneration, Township redevelopment and City Building-Lessons on implementation of Bridge City Town centre

A presentation was made by **Nokey Mthethwa** from eThekweni municipality regarding the Silverglen Nature Reserve Revitalization Project (pdf).

The presentation made the following points:

- Construction of bridge city was a project initiated by the president in 2007.
- Is a 6 billion rand project , located 17km from the city centre of Durban
- Reasons for the project stem from the fact that the community could not access social facilities and retail outlets
- Institutional setting: joint venture project between Tongaat Hulett Development and the city of eThekweni
- Project overseen by bridge management association and team of urban management specialists
- The approach to the project was that the community members were consulted on the project

- The project places importance in facilitating spatial integration through urban infill and utilising the Development framework as a means to do that.
- The outputs from the project include the creation of 8000 jobs and 1500 temporary jobs

- A provincial hospital is being built as a result of the project
- Building confidence in investors to invest in public driven investment
- Lessons learned from the project include:
 - Quality of life improvements
 - Skills development
 - Relationships formed between the city and the community
- Transfer of methodology
 - Needs analysis
 - Make use of skills of multiple partners
 - Widespread concept
 - Community needs to take ownership of the project

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that it would good to quantify the work opportunities that are being created on each of the projects. There is a need to quantify the job creation opportunities. Asking the questions of hoe many job opportunities did we create and the potential of job continuity. He required clarity on which grant is talked about within the Bridge City project.

Max Vogt (GIZ) asked the question relating to the Bridge City project and the Silverglen Nature Reserve Revitalization Project. In terms of open spaces/parks in the projects, he wanted to find out what is done to bring the community to the use the green spaces? How is the community engaged?

Dr Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN) commented that the presentations exhibit innovation and the city of Ethekwini is the city that showcases that well. She asked that because SACN is a learning network and because there are people from other cities who see the projects and thinking about whether they could utilise the case studies, what as officials, who have had to do things that were easy or not easy to do. What lessons can be shared about what makes the approaches and methodologies adopted in the projects to be successful? How does one get innovation done through the system? Where do the ideas come from when initiating projects?

Thobile Ngcobo (eThekweni municipality) responded that in terms of ABM, there have certainly been work opportunities created. In terms of street cleaning and landscaping, there is a total of 107 staff. The rooftop garden has 4 people employed and there is potential for more employment around the inner city in the form of parking meter guards. By bringing in security ambassadors around the city through incentive grants.

Sbu Chamane (Ethekewini municipality) added that the 107 participants that have been mentioned are beneficiaries of the EPWP incentive grant since the inception of the project.

Nokey Mthethwa (eThekweni municipality) responded to the question around which grant she referred to in the presentation that she had made. The grant that was being referred was the Neighbourhood development partnership grant from National Treasury.

Eurakha Singh (eThekweni municipality) responded by stating that there is no need to quantify the job opportunities within the Silverglen Nature Reserve Revitalisation Project. The AGM is not in a position to quantify just yet. Will be keeping records to see how many local people who are currently not being paid for their services can be able to translate into work opportunities at a later stage.

The community started from the project. A project that comes from the community can be sustained. The AGM does social marketing of the project in order to document what has been done and how the project is progressing. This generates interests from the community. As a city they are encouraged to think innovatively and outside the box. The ABM methodology encourages innovative as well.

Linda Mbonambi (Ethekewini municipality) added that leadership plays a huge role in terms of encouraging innovation in cities. In terms of the IDP, eThekweni is a learning city. It is better to learn from failure than not starting at all.

Sbu Chamane (Ethekewini municipality) commented that that in terms of innovation, the ABM has excelled. When programme was initiated, it the advantage of EU funding and support where key result areas were established. The ABM practitioners thinking is different from city officials hence able to initiate things that are not done in the city and breaking the silo mentality.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the case studies presented are innovative and there is a need to do a write up of these projects as it is essential to learn from them. There is already the writing up of the Rooftop Garden and the entire UDZ. Reporting is important too in terms of reporting. Where there is reporting there is a possibility to get incentive grant.

Sister City Partnership and Job Creation

A presentation was made by Eric Apelgren from eThekweni municipality regarding the Sister City partnership and job creation(ppt).

The presentation highlighted the following:

- Being a clean liveable city is what drives the EPWP programme
- To make sure that communities are able to access real meaningful work
- The key focus indicator is the unemployment level (500 000 people). That is why EPWP is important
- Further 9000 people included within the municipal boundary
- Ethekewini home to 50% of the population of the province
- EPWP sits in the mayors palour. The city has elevated EPWP and has been considered the mayoral lead programme.
- City budgets are being directed towards poorest parts of the city
- 18 Sister cities across the world -some agreements have been signed with some of the sister cities.
- There are 23 diplomats in the city
- ILO is a partner the city engages with. What have they done across where EPWP could benefit their programme
- Green energy sector is creating more jobs than oil/ gas across the world
- The question that was posed was that “What role can private sector play in EPWP?”
- To what extent does the province, the city and national have a synergy around financing, training, capacitating individuals.
- BRICS countries what is in those cities that in terms of processes and systems can we gain value from, for EPWP. The BRICS banks what can they do in terms of funding EPWP
- How can collaboration occur, and models be looked at across the world?
- 13 out of the 18 Strategic Integrated Projects of the presidency will directly affect the eThekwini municipality
- There should find ways to maximise intergovernmental international relations practitioners to add value to what EPWP is doing.
- What are the case studies where international partnerships have benefitted the community

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the department has a set of activities they are engaging in. The ILO is a partner with EPWP. The department is getting technical assistance from ILO. Benchmarking is done with them. There projects with the department of energy (Solar water heater programme) . Artisan training is occurring in EPWP, challenge with getting people with N4. There are other projects such as Working for Water. Presentations illustrates many avenues for EPWP. Looking into sustainable livelihoods. Presentations will be made available to everyone

Learnerships as a means to job creation

A presentation was made by Mhlengi Gumede from eThekwini municipality regarding the Sister City partnership and job creation (ppt).

The presentation made the following points:

- The presentation focused on the learnership programme
- Cato Manor-there are two meta focus outcomes

- Role of ABM is that of an overseer, coordinator, facilitator and implementer of social and economic development initiatives.
- The starting is that Cato Manor faces various challenges such as Growth and expansion of the key business sectors in the area
- LED Strategy with objectives:
 - Human Capital Development
 - Facilitation of Private Sector Investment and Partnerships
 - Coordination and implementation
 - Creation of an enabling environment
- The approach utilised included engagement with community and various stakeholders, Establishment of the Local Economic Development Forum and workshops, training and capacity building programmes to be sector needs driven
- Outputs
 - Training and Skills Development Programme and Learnerships (105)
 - Plumbing Learnership
- Lessons:
 - The combination of poverty eradication with a market-based approach is key to the success of the local economic development programme.
 - Attention should also be given in addressing issues raised by local businesses in the need to access affordable financing and relevant skills and training
- Transfer:
 - The Plumbing Learnership Programme is the first of its kind and is currently piloted in Cato Manor
 - It capacitates each Learner to establish and register the business and be self employed or seek employment

Discussions

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the project is innovative in that it addresses issues of youth unemployment. Important to make link. Similar project is being undertaken called the National Youth Service being done by the province. What is the approximate cost of learnerships? How long it takes to get trade test? What is the plan to keep learnership sustainable?

Mhlengi Gumede (Ethekewini municipality) commented that in terms of the costs of the learnership. The participants get a stipend of R1800 a month. There are also costs incurred with service providers where the Cato Manor ABM office is coordinating in terms of pulling in internal line departments. The trade test takes approximately 18-24 months, its four years before trade test is done. Its structured in a way that plumbing is professionalised. ABM is in discussion with the Architectural services in order for them to budget for beneficiaries.

Ignatius Ariyo (DPW-EPWP) commented that the learnerships in the department have their own challenges, takes four years to get to trade test. Good opportunity to get young people in.

Conclusion

Some of the case studies need to be written up in order to circulate to a wider audience. There is a lot that could be learnt. The next dates of the meeting will be discussed and confirmation of venue will be decided between Ekurleni and Mangaung. The chairperson declared the meeting closed at 1.30pm.

Annexure I: ATTENDANCE LIST

1	Apelgren	Eric	Ethekwini Municipality	Head	eric.apelgren@durban.gov.za	0643068695	0313112124
2	Ariyo	Ignatius	Department of Public Works-EPWP	Chief Director	ignatius.ariyo@dpw.gov.za	27828865346	0124921446
3	Bhana	Sadhna	South African Cities Network	Programmes Coordinator	sadhna@sacities.net	27825050669	27114076471
4	Chamane	Sbu	Ethekwini Municipality	Senior Manager	sbusiso.chamane@durban.gov.za	0832744193	0313116434
5	Cossa	Sihle	Ethekwini Municipality		sihle.cossa@durban.gov.za	0613591059	
6	Gcwabaza	Hlengiwe	Ethekwini Municipality	Coordinator	hlengiwe.gawabaza@durban.gov.za	0828310844	0313116450
7	Gumede	Mhlengi	Ethekwini Municipality	Manager	mhlengi.gumede@durban.gov.za	0832745571	0313224490
8	Haripersad	Anil	Ethekwini Municipality	Manager	anil.haripersad@durban.gov.za	0849536466	0313116451
9	Hariram	Dilip	Ethekwini Municipality	Auditor	dilip.hariram@durban.gov.za	0	0313113047
10	Henderson	Stanley William	Department of Public Works-EPWP	DDG	stanley.henderson@dpw.gov.za	27836765119	273372642
11	Hlongiwa	Thando	Ethekwini Municipality	Technical Advisor	thando.hlongiwa@durban.gov.za	0716067919	0312656007
12	Kango	Mfuneko	Department of Public Works-EPWP	Deputy Director	mfuneko.kango@dpw.gov.za	0795234903	0873572298
13	Karuri-Sebina	Geci	South African Cities Network	Associate	geci@sacities.net	721481132	0114076409
14	Lesoma	Musa	Ethekwini Municipality	Coordinator	musa.lesoma@durban.gov.za	0833860711	0313116448
15	Mahlangu	Nelson	City of Tshwane	Director	nelsonmah7@tshwane.gov.za	27833998648	0123582499
16	Manganya	Keneilwe	South African Cities Network	Intern	keneilwe@sacities.net	0763911399	0114076651
17	Mathebula	Lethokuhle	Mangaung	Admin Manager	lethokuhle.mathebula@mangaung.co.za	0864985598	0514058015

18	Mbonambi	Linda	Ethekwini Municipality	Head	linda.mbonambi@durban.gov.za	0732267994	0313320441
19	Mekhoe	Tich	City of Tshwane	Group Head	tichm@tshwane.gov.za	0723258670	0123584715
20	Mthethwa	Nockey	Ethekwini Municipality		nockey.mthethwa@durban.gov.za	0763855230	0323114610
21	Naick	Thamindhrin Dhaten	Msunduzi Municipality	Manager	steven.naick@msunduzi.gov.za	0823796244	0333923509
22	Naidoo	Ricky	Ethekwini Municipality	Senior Manager	naidoori@durban.gov.za	0832540292	0313113055
23	Ngcobo	Thobile	Ethekwini Municipality		thobile.ngcobo3@durban.gov.za	0823888193	
24	Ngongowa	Vusi	Ethekwini Municipality	Acting Manager	vusuwazi.ngongowa@durban.gov.za	0843163624	
25	Nofilita-Doni	Somikazi	Nelson Mandela Bay	Coordinator	snofilita-Doni@mandelametro.gov.za	0837438541	0415062543
26	Philip	Kate	GTAC		t.katephilip@gmail.com	0836289443	
27	Ratsiane	Phillip	City of Tshwane		phillipr@tshwane.gov.za	0827786603	
28	Seleso	Mahlomola	Mangaung	Budget Coordinator	mahlomola.seleso@mangaung.co.za	0733328158	
29	Sibisi	Noel	Ethekwini Municipality	Coordinator	noel.sibisi@durban.gov.za	0783492157	0313116447
30	Singh	Eurakha	Ethekwini Municipality	Senior Manager	eurakha.singh@durban.gov.za	0837802374	0313228401
31	Singh	Jessie	Ethekwini Municipality	Writer	jessie.singh@durban.gov.za	0	0313114817
32	Skhumbuzo	Ndawande	Msunduzi Innovation and Development Institute (MIDI)	Manager	skhumbuzondawande@msunduzi.gov.za	0718866489	
33	Stoessel	Max	Ethekwini Municipality		max.stoessel@durban.gov.za	0658667418	
34	Tschoppe	Nils	Ethekwini Municipality		nils.tschoppe@durban.gov.za	0	
35	Upton	Godfrey	Ethekwini Municipality		godfrey.upton@durban.gov.za	0837753130	0313116383
36	Van Luyk	Donovan	Ethekwini Municipality	Senior Auditor	donovan.vanluyk@durban.gov.za	0847091106	0313117713

37	Vogt	Maximilian	GIZ	Technical Advisor	maximilian.vogt@giz.de	0788201440	
38	Wababa	Thando	Department of Public Works	Deputy Director	thando.wababa@dpw.gov.za	0823331015	0214622145
39	Zuma	Mandla	Msunduzi Municipality	Senior Manager	mandla.zuma@msunduzi.gov.za	0784398740	27333922705

Apologies:

- Simphiwe Dunjana (Buffalo City Municipality)
- Andisa Ntwasa (Buffalo City Municipality)
- Felile Ngcobo (Ekurhuleni)
- Edwell Gumbo (City of Johannesburg)
- Patson Khosa (City of Johannesburg)